

BEFORE THE
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING COMMISSION
STATE OF MISSOURI

FILED

JUN 09 2003

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING
COMMISSION

MISSOURI STATE BOARD OF
REGISTRATION FOR THE HEALING ARTS,

Petitioner,

v.

BHANU SHAH

Respondent.

Case No. 03-0418HA

**JOINT STIPULATION OF FACTS, WAIVER OF HEARINGS BEFORE THE
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING COMMISSION AND
STATE BOARD OF REGISTRATION FOR THE HEALING ARTS,
AND CONSENT ORDER WITH JOINT PROPOSED
FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

Pursuant to the rules governing practice and procedure before the Administrative Hearing Commission 1 CSR 15-3.440(1), and pursuant to the terms of §536.060, RSMo 2000, as it is made applicable to the Administrative Hearing Commission by §621.135, RSMo 2000, Respondent, Bhanu Shah, and the Missouri State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts ("the Board") waive their right to a hearing and decision of the above-styled case by the Administrative Hearing Commission and, additionally, the right to a disciplinary hearing before the State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts under §621.110, RSMo 2000, and jointly stipulate and agree that a final disposition of this matter may be effectuated as described below in this Joint Stipulation of Facts, Waiver of Hearings Before the Administrative Hearing Commission and State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts, and Consent Order with Joint Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law ("the Agreement").

1. Respondent, Bhanu Shah, acknowledges that she understands the various rights and privileges afforded her by law and understands that this Agreement is in lieu of a contested case hearing by the Administrative Hearing Commission ("the Commission") where she would have the right to appear and be represented by counsel, the right to a hearing of the charges pending against Respondent; the right to have all charges against Respondent proven upon the record by competent and substantial evidence; the right to cross-examine any witness appearing at the hearing against Respondent; the right to present evidence on Respondent's own behalf at the hearing; the right to a decision upon the record of the hearing by a fair and impartial administrative hearing commissioner concerning the charges pending against Respondent; the right to a ruling on questions of law by an administrative hearing commissioner; the right to seek recovery of attorney's fees and costs; the right to a disciplinary hearing before the Board at which time evidence may be presented in mitigation of discipline and the right to obtain judicial review of the decisions of the Administrative Hearing Commission and the State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts. Having been advised of these rights provided Respondent by operation of law, Respondent knowingly and voluntarily waives each and every one of these rights and freely enters into this Joint Stipulation of Facts, Waiver of Hearings before the Administrative Hearing Commission and State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts, and Consent Order With Joint Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law and agrees to abide by the terms of this document as they pertain to Respondent.

2. Respondent acknowledges that she has received a copy of the Complaint filed with the Administrative Hearing Commission in this cause, and waives service of that Complaint by the Administrative Hearing Commission.

3. The parties stipulate and agree that the disciplinary order agreed to by Petitioner and Respondent in Part II herein is based only on the Joint Proposed Findings of Fact set out in Part I herein. Respondent understands that the Board may take further disciplinary action against Respondent based on facts or conduct not specifically mentioned in this document that are either now known to the Board or may be discovered after the approval of this Agreement by the Administrative Hearing Commission.

4. Respondent hereby waives and releases the Board, its members and any of its employees, agents, or attorneys, including any former Board members, employees, agents, and attorneys, of, or from, any liability, claim, actions, causes of action, fees costs and expenses, and compensation, including, but not limited to any claims for attorney's fees and expenses, including any claims pursuant to §536.087, RSMo 2000, or any claim arising under 42 USC 1983, which may be based upon, arise out of, or relate to any of the matters raised in this agreement, or from the negotiation or execution of this agreement. The parties acknowledge that this paragraph is severable from the remaining portions of this agreement in that it survives in perpetuity even in the event that any court of law deems this agreement or any portion thereof void or unenforceable.

5. Respondent understands and agrees that the Missouri State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts will maintain this Agreement as an open record of the Board as required by Chapters 334, 610, 620 and 621, RSMo, as amended.

I.

Based upon the foregoing, Petitioner and Respondent herein jointly stipulate to the following Joint Proposed Findings of Fact and Joint Proposed Conclusions of Law and request

that the Administrative Hearing Commission adopt the Joint Proposed Findings of Fact and the Joint Proposed Conclusions of Law as the Administrative Hearing Commission's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law:

JOINT PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts ("the Board") is an agency of the State of Missouri created and established pursuant to §334.120, for the purpose of executing and enforcing the provisions of Chapter 334, RSMo.

2. Respondent ("Licensee") is licensed by the Board as a physician and surgeon, license number 33336. This license was first issued on January 9, 1971. This license is current and active and was so at all times relevant herein.

3. Licensee was licensed to practice medicine by the State of Michigan, Department of Consumer & Industry Services, Bureau of Health Services, Board of Medicine ("Michigan Board of Medicine"), license number 43-01-031534.

4. On or about December 12, 2001, the Michigan Board of Medicine assessed a fine and reprimanded Licensee's license. The Michigan order assessing a fine and reprimanding Licensee's license is a final disciplinary action against Licensee's license to practice the healing arts in Michigan.

5. The Michigan order to assess a fine and reprimand Licensee's license was based on Licensee's failure to conform to minimal standards of acceptable medical practice and negligence.

JOINT PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. Cause exists to discipline Licensee's license pursuant to §334.100.2(8), RSMo 2000, which states in pertinent part:

2. The board may cause a complaint to be filed with the administrative hearing commission as provided by chapter 621, RSMo, against any holder of any certificate of registration or authority, permit or license required by this chapter or any person who has failed to renew or has surrendered the person's certificate of registration or authority, permit or license for any one or any combination of the following causes:

(8) Revocation, suspension, restriction, modification, limitation, reprimand, warning, censure, probation or other final disciplinary action against the holder of or applicant for a license or other right to practice any profession regulated by this chapter by another state, territory, federal agency or country, whether or not voluntarily agreed to by the licensee or applicant, including, but not limited to, the denial of licensure, surrender of the license, allowing the license to expire or lapse, or discontinuing or limiting the practice of medicine while subject to an investigation or while actually under investigation by any licensing authority, medical facility, branch of the armed forces of the United States of America, insurance company, court, agency of the state or federal government, or employer;

2. Respondent's conduct, as established by the foregoing facts, falls within the intendments of § 334.100.2(8), RSMo 2000.

3. Cause exists for Petitioner to take disciplinary action against Respondent's license

pursuant to §334.100.2(8), RSMo 2000.

II.

Based on the foregoing, the parties mutually agree and stipulate that the following shall constitute the disciplinary order entered by the State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts in this matter under the authority of §621.110, RSMo 2000. This disciplinary order will be effective immediately upon the issuance of the consent order of the Administrative Hearing Commission approving this Agreement without further action by either party.

1. The physician and surgeon license, No. 33336, issued to Respondent is hereby VOLUNTARILY SURRENDERED, in lieu of discipline. Respondent shall immediately return her physician and surgeon license, wall-hanging certificate, pocket card, and all other indicia of licensure to the State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts. Respondent understands that this Agreement will be reported to the National Practitioner's Databank.

2. This Order does not bind the Board or restrict the remedies available to it concerning any other violation of Chapter 334, RSMo, by Respondent not specifically mentioned in this document.

3. In consideration of the foregoing, the parties consent to the entry of record and approval of this Joint Stipulation of Facts, Waiver of Hearings before the Administrative Hearing Commission and State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts, and Consent Order and to the termination of any further proceedings before the Administrative Hearing Commission based upon the complaint filed by Petitioner in the above-styled case.

RESPONDENT

PETITIONER

Bhanu Shah 5/30/03
Date

Tina Steinman 6/3/03
Tina Steinman Date
Executive Director

JEREMIAH W. (JAY) NIXON
Attorney General

Michael J. Schmid
Michael J. Schmid
Assistant Attorney General
Missouri Bar No. 53847

7th Floor, Broadway State Office Building
221 West High Street
Post Office Box 899
Jefferson City, MO 65102
Telephone: 573-751-1143
Telefax: 573-751-5660

Attorneys for Petitioner

EFFECTIVE THIS 12 DAY OF June, 2003.

Before the
Administrative Hearing Commission
State of Missouri



STATE BOARD OF REGISTRATION FOR
THE HEALING ARTS,

Petitioner,

vs.

BHANU J. SHAH, M.D.,

Respondent.

No. 03-0418 HA

CONSENT ORDER

The licensing authority filed a complaint. Section 621.045, RSMo 2000, gives us jurisdiction.

On June 9, 2003, the parties filed a "Joint Stipulation of Facts, Waiver of Hearings Before the Administrative Hearing Commission and State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts, and Consent Order With Joint Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law." Our review of the document shows that the parties have stipulated to certain facts and waived their right to a hearing before us. Because the parties have agreed to these facts, we incorporate them into this order and adopt them as stipulated. *Buckner v. Buckner*, 912 S.W. 2d 65, 70 (Mo. App., W.D. 1995). We conclude that the licensee is subject to discipline under § 334.100.2(8), RSMo 2000. We incorporate the parties' proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law into this Consent Order. We certify the record to the licensing agency under § 621.110, RSMo 2000.

The only issue before this Commission is whether the stipulated conduct constitutes cause to discipline the license. The appropriate disciplinary action is not within our power to decide; that is subject to the licensing authority's decision or the parties' agreement. Section 621.110, RSMo 2000.

No statute authorizes us to determine whether the agency has complied with the provisions of section 621.045.3. RSMo 2000. We have no power to superintend agency compliance with statutory procedures. *Missouri Health Facilities Review Comm. v. Administrative Hearing Comm'n*, 700 S.W. 2d 445, 450 (Mo. banc 1985). Therefore, we do not determine whether the agency complied with such procedures.

SO ORDERED on June 11, 2003.

JUNE STRIEGEL DOUGHTY
Commissioner